



---

Early Christianity in Asia Minor

Author(s): Sherman E. Johnson

Reviewed work(s):

Source: *Journal of Biblical Literature*, Vol. 77, No. 1 (Mar., 1958), pp. 1-17

Published by: [The Society of Biblical Literature](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3264325>

Accessed: 09/04/2012 10:15

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at

<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



*The Society of Biblical Literature* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Journal of Biblical Literature*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

# EARLY CHRISTIANITY IN ASIA MINOR\*

SHERMAN E. JOHNSON

CHURCH DIVINITY SCHOOL OF THE PACIFIC

ANATOLIA, that great extension of the Asiatic continent toward the Aegean and Europe, was second only to Italy in the first century of our era in commercial, intellectual, and artistic life. No one needs to argue its importance for the origins of Christianity. Here the Apostle Paul was born and carried on much of his missionary work. Some of his most important letters arose out of problems with churches in Galatia and the city of Colossae. The Apocalypse, the First Epistle of Peter, and the correspondence between Pliny and Trajan reflect the conflict between emperor worship and Christianity in Asia Minor. To list the churches addressed by the prophet John in the first three chapters of his work, and those to which Ignatius of Antioch wrote letters, is to catalogue some of the most important centers of western Anatolia. It is often believed that the Fourth Gospel comes from Ephesus. Papias of Hierapolis, Polycarp of Smyrna, Melito of Sardis, and Polycrates of Ephesus are important Asiatic figures of the second century. Montanism arose in Phrygia and Marcion came from Sinope in Pontus. Christianity took such varied forms in Anatolia that it can be said to reflect the variety and intellectual ferment of this fascinating region.

## I

Early travelers, such as Pococke, Hamilton, and Fellows, laid the basis for later archeological and topographical study of Asia Minor.<sup>1</sup> Large-scale excavation began in the nineteenth century. No classical site has stirred the modern imagination more profoundly than Troy; but although Ilion has a Roman period, its greatest importance, as in

\* The Presidential Address delivered at the annual meeting of the Society of Biblical Literature and Exegesis on December 30, 1957, at the Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, Louisville, Kentucky.

<sup>1</sup> Richard Pococke, *A Description of the East and Some Other Countries* (London, 1743-45); Sir Charles Fellows, *A Journal Written during an Excursion in Asia Minor, 1838* (London, 1839); *An Account of Discoveries in Lycia* (London, 1841); *Travels and Researches in Asia Minor* (London, 1852); W. J. Hamilton, *Researches in Asia Minor, Pontus and Armenia* (London, 1842); S. H. Weber, *Voyages and Travels in Greece, the Near East . . . prior to . . . 1801* (Princeton, 1953).

Schliemann's time, still centers in the Homeric period.<sup>2</sup> The uncovering of other ancient cities revealed much about the architecture and material culture of the NT period. The most dramatic discoveries, from this point of view, were at Pergamum and Ephesus. Perhaps nowhere more than at Pergamum can one perceive the imagination of the Hellenistic people, the sumptuousness of their art, and the continued magnificence of the early empire. The altar of Zeus and the vast theater, together with the numerous temples and public buildings, are part of the background of the Book of Revelation, whose author regarded the city as Satan's throne (Rev 2 13). Karl Humann first visited the place in the winter of 1864–65 and began excavations there in 1878.<sup>3</sup> Of perhaps even greater interest to NT students was Ephesus, where even earlier J. T. Wood had been at work. First to be identified and excavated was the temple of Artemis.<sup>4</sup> Then followed the work of the Austrian Archaeological Institute in uncovering the theater, the Library of Celsus, the Agora, and the Christian churches.<sup>5</sup>

One may conveniently take as a unit the period up to the outbreak of the first World War, even though the continuity of research was never broken. One of the earliest excavations that had some bearing on the history of the first century was that of the British at Halicarnassus in 1856–59.<sup>6</sup> The Archaeological Institute of America uncovered the Roman agora of Assos in 1881–83.<sup>7</sup> Rayet made explorations of Miletus and the Latmic gulf, Tralles, Magnesia near Maeander, Priene and Didyma, in 1872–73.<sup>8</sup> A French expedition worked at Didyma in 1895 and 1896.<sup>9</sup> Humann excavated at Magnesia near Maeander in 1891–93, revealing the great Artemis temple there.<sup>10</sup> At Priene the Germans were at work in the years 1895 to 1898, and the excavations of Theodor Wiegand and his associates in Miletus and environs began in 1899.<sup>11</sup>

<sup>2</sup> E. g., H. Schliemann, *Troja* (New York, 1884), pp. 195–241.

<sup>3</sup> Karl Humann and others, *Altertümer von Pergamon* (Berlin, 1885–1923); cf. H. Kähler, *Der grosse Fries von Pergamon* (Berlin, 1948) and Kähler's picture book, *Pergamon* (Berlin, 1949).

<sup>4</sup> J. F. Wood, *Discoveries at Ephesus* (London, 1877); D. G. Hogarth, *The Archaic Artemisia* (London, 1908).

<sup>5</sup> *Forschungen in Ephesos veröffentlicht vom Österreichischen archäologischen Institute* (Vienna, 1906–53).

<sup>6</sup> Sir C. T. Newton, *A History of Discoveries at Halicarnassus, Cnidus and Branchidae* (London, 1862–63).

<sup>7</sup> F. H. Bacon (ed.), *Expedition of the Archaeological Institute of America: Investigations at Assos* (Cambridge, Mass., 1902–21).

<sup>8</sup> O. Rayet, *Milet et le golfe Latmique* (Paris, 1877–85).

<sup>9</sup> E. Pontremoli and B. Haussoulier, *Didymes: Fouilles de 1895 et 1896* (Paris, 1904).

<sup>10</sup> K. Humann, *Magnesia am Maeander* (Berlin, 1904).

<sup>11</sup> Th. Wiegand and H. Schrader, *Priene: Ergebnisse der Ausgrabungen und Untersuchungen in den Jahren 1895–1898* (Berlin, 1904); Wiegand (ed.), *Milet* (Berlin, 1906–

Just before the first World War came the Princeton expedition to Sardis, which continued for several seasons. Much of the effort was concentrated on the splendid Ionic temple of Artemis, which is of some special interest to us because of its rebuilding after the earthquake of A. D. 19, but there were important discoveries from the Lydian and other periods.<sup>12</sup>

Surface exploration also yielded a wealth of material, usually published in a sumptuous style that would be very costly today. Inscriptions form an important part of this. LeBas was the great pioneer epigrapher,<sup>13</sup> but nearly every scientific explorer since his time has made contributions. One of the first Americans to work in this field was J. R. S. Sterrett, who was in Lystra and other parts of central Asia Minor as early as 1883.<sup>14</sup> Another important feature was the recording of monuments visible above ground. The publication of Hierapolis in Phrygia by Humann and his associates is a good example of this.<sup>15</sup> Among the outstanding published explorations are the following: Keil and Von Premerstein in Lydia and Aeolis;<sup>16</sup> Benndorf and Niemann in Lydia and Caria, and Petersen and Von Luschen in Lycia, Milyas, and the Kibyra region;<sup>17</sup> Swoboda, Keil, and Knoll in parts of Lycaonia, Pamphylia, and Isauria;<sup>18</sup> Lanc-koroński in Pamphylia and Pisidia;<sup>19</sup> Heberdey and Wilberg, the tombs of Termessos;<sup>20</sup> in Cilicia, A. C. Headlam, Heberdey, Keil, and Wilhelm.<sup>21</sup>

36). Cf. also A. von Gerkan, "Zum Heiligtum des Apollon Delphinios in Milet," *Istanbuler Forschungen*, XVII (1950), 35-39.

<sup>12</sup> H. C. Butler and others, *Sardis* (Leiden, Princeton, Rome, 1922-32).

<sup>13</sup> P. LeBas and W. H. Waddington, *Inscriptions grecques et latines recueillies en Grèce et en Asie Mineure*, III (Paris, 1870); see also S. Reinach, *Voyage archéologique en Grèce et en Asie Mineure sous la direction de M. Philippe LeBas* (Paris, 1888).

<sup>14</sup> J. R. S. Sterrett, *The Wolfe Expedition to Asia Minor* ("Papers of the American School of Classical Studies at Athens," III [Boston, 1888]). This is largely inscriptional material. In Vol. I of the series (1882), Sterrett published inscriptions of Assos and Tralles.

<sup>15</sup> C. Humann and others, *Altertümer von Hierapolis* (Berlin, 1898).

<sup>16</sup> J. Keil and A. von Premerstein, "Bericht über eine Reise in Lydien und der südlichen Aiolis," *Denkschriften der kaiserlichen Akademie der Wissenschaften, Phil.-hist. Klasse*, LIII, 2 (Vienna, 1910), 1-112.

<sup>17</sup> O. Benndorf and G. Niemann, *Reisen in Lykien und Karien* (Vienna, 1884); E. Petersen and F. von Luschen, *Reisen in Lykien, Milyas und Kibyratris* (Vienna, 1889).

<sup>18</sup> H. Swoboda, J. Keil, and Fritz Knoll, *Denkmäler aus Lykaonien, Pamphylien und Isaurien* (Brünn, 1935). Cf. also H. Rott, *Kleinasiatische Denkmäler aus Pisidien, Pamphylien, Kappadokien und Lykien* (Leipzig, 1908).

<sup>19</sup> Karl Lanc-koroński-Brzezie, *Städte Pamphyliens und Pisidiens* (2 vols.; Vienna, 1890-92).

<sup>20</sup> R. Heberdey and W. Wilberg, "Grabbauten von Termessos in Pisidia," *Jahresheft des Österreichischen archäologischen Institutes in Wien*, III (1900), 177-210.

<sup>21</sup> A. C. Headlam, *Ecclesiastical Sites in Isauria* (London, 1892); J. Keil and A. Wilhelm, "Vorläufiger Bericht über eine Reise in Kilikien," *JOAI*, XVIII (1915), Beiblatt, pp. 5-59; R. Heberdey and A. Wilhelm, "Reisen in Kilikien," *Denkschr.*,

Hasluck published a study of Cyzicus and other parts of Mysia.<sup>22</sup> The geographical studies of Alfred Philippson have been of particular value to later investigators.<sup>23</sup>

Best known in English-speaking lands is the pioneer topographer and epigraphist, Sir William M. Ramsay, who traveled over the land many times, published inscriptions and coins, and collected all kinds of historical-geographical information, particularly in Phrygia. Beginning with the Peutinger table and accounts in ancient authors, he laid the foundation for modern studies of the Anatolian road systems.<sup>24</sup> Most of us know him best as a great popularizer, who digested a vast amount of information and made it available to biblical students. So attractive and persuasive were his books that he has often been followed too slavishly, but despite errors into which his enthusiasm led him, his work remains one of the foundations of later Anatolian studies.<sup>25</sup>

Much material of value for the study of the NT and early church history can be found in the work of Victor Schultze, who collected and made available facts about many sites.<sup>26</sup> But it is the articles in the Pauly-Wissowa *Realenzyklopädie* which, above all, bring together all kinds of information about Asia Minor, gathered in the pre-War period. Here the work of Ruge, Büchner, and Keil is of particular value.<sup>27</sup>

## II

The period since 1918 can best be summarized as a unit, for, despite the interruption of the second World War, many of the same persons and organizations were active both before 1940 and after 1945. British, French, German, Italian, Swedish, and American expeditions have been in the field. The great new fact, which promises so well for the future, is

XLIV, 6 (Vienna, 1896), 1-168. Humann was apparently the first to study the site of Nemrud Dağ; see *Reisen in Kleinasien und Nordsyrien* (Berlin, 1890).

<sup>22</sup> F. W. Hasluck, *Cyzicus* (Cambridge, 1910).

<sup>23</sup> A. Philippson, *Reisen und Forschungen in westlichen Kleinasien*, "Ergänzungshefte Nr. 167, 172, 177, 180 zu Petermanns Mitteilungen" (Gotha, 1910-14).

<sup>24</sup> W. M. Ramsay, *The Historical Geography of Asia Minor* ("Royal Geographical Society, Supplementary Papers," IV [London, 1890]), esp. pp. 51-62, 237-42, 254-81.

<sup>25</sup> See especially Ramsay, *Cities and Bishoprics of Phrygia* (Oxford, 1895-97); *St. Paul the Traveller and the Roman Citizen* (3rd ed.; London, 1897); *The Cities of St. Paul* (London, 1907); *Studies in the History and Art of the Eastern Provinces of the Roman Empire* (London, 1906), pp. 231-77, 305-77 (on Pisidian Antioch); *Pauline and Other Studies in Early Christian History* (2nd ed.; London, 1908); *The Church in the Roman Empire before A. D. 170* (8th ed.; London, 1904); *The Social Basis of Roman Power in Asia Minor* (Aberdeen, 1941).

<sup>26</sup> V. Schultze, *Altchristliche Städte und Landschaften*, II (Gütersloh, 1922).

<sup>27</sup> E. g., Pauly-Wissowa, *Realenzyklopädie*, 2nd series, s. v. Assos, Ephesos, Hierapolis, Laodikeia, Magnesia, Miletus, Philadelphia, Sardeis, Smyrna, Thyateira, Tralles.

the activity of Turkish archeologists, both men and women, in excavating sites of all periods, exploring, recording, and publishing; and their friendly co-operation with European and American colleagues.<sup>28</sup> As compared with the great days of the past, the work is usually on a smaller scale, since costs are higher and money is more difficult to find. Often an excavation has been begun and not carried through; on the other hand, methods are constantly being improved.

Many of the more sensational discoveries, such as the bilingual inscription in Phoenician and Hittite cuneiform found at Karatepe by Bossert, and the royal tomb at Gordium, lie outside the scope of a paper dealing with the NT period. I shall mention some of the more important excavations, classifying them by areas.

*Ionia.* At Ephesus the Austrian excavations, now resumed, are establishing more details of the city plan and history of the site.<sup>29</sup> At Claros there had been excavations in 1913. These were resumed at the sanctuary of Apollo in 1950 by Louis Robert and his wife.<sup>30</sup> Turkish scholars began excavating the great agora of Izmir (Smyrna) as early as 1932, and Ekrem Akurgal has carried on studies of the topography of the Izmir region to co-ordinate ancient data with the existing remains.<sup>31</sup>

*Caria and the Maeander valley.* M. and Mme. Robert have studied several sites in this region, including Nysa, which was excavated by Kourouniotis after the first World War.<sup>32</sup> Wiegand's first volume on Didyma has been published and excavations have been resumed at

<sup>28</sup> For Turkish archeological work, besides references given below, see the annual summaries in *Anatolian Studies* from 1951 on; also Thomas Whittemore, "Archaeology during the Republic in Turkey," *AJA*, XLVII (1943), 164-70; A. M. Mansel, "Les Travaux Turcs d'archéologie classique sous la République," *Anadolu*, I (1951), 41-53; H. Çambel, "Archäologischen Berichte aus Anatolien," *Orientalia*, N. S. XV (1951), 236-51; Machteld Mellink, "Archaeology in Asia Minor," *AJA*, LIX (1955), 231-40.

<sup>29</sup> Information furnished by Dr. Machteld J. Mellink; see now her article in *AJA*, LXII (1958), 91-104. Among recent publications are *Forschungen in Ephesos*, III (Vienna, 1923): the Agora and gateways at the Harbor; V (corrected ed., Vienna, 1953): the Library.

<sup>30</sup> J. and L. Robert, *Anadolu*, I (1951), 61-63; II (1955), 50-52; L. Robert, *Les Fouilles de Claros* (Limoges, 1954); *Anatolian Studies*, VI (1956), 23-25. The Roberts were at work in Claros in 1956.

<sup>31</sup> S. Kantar and F. Miltner, *Türk Tarih, Arkeologya ve Etnografya Dergisi*, II (1934), 219 f.; Kantar and R. Naumann, *Türk Tarih Kurumu Belleten*, VII (1943), 213 ff.; cf. *Belleten*, IX (1945), 405 ff.; Naumann and Kantar, "Die Agora von Smyrna," *Istanbuler Forschungen*, XVII (1950), 69-114. On other early Turkish work see A. M. Mansel, *Anadolu*, I (1951), 41-53. For inscriptions from the Agora, see J. Keil, *Istanbuler Forschungen*, XVII (1950), 54-68. E. Akurgal, *Ankara Dil ve Tarih Coğrafya Fakültesi, Arkeoloji araştırmaları*, II (1945), 1 ff.; *Belleten*, X (1946), 55 ff.

<sup>32</sup> *Anadolu*, I (1951), 61; *Fasti Archaeologici*, IV (1951), 290; *Anadolu*, II (1955), 50-52. Nysa had been excavated by a Greek expedition in 1921 and 1922; see K. Kourouniotis, *Ἀρχαιολογικόν Δελτίον*, VII (1921-22), 1-88, 227-46.

Miletus.<sup>33</sup> The most important activity of the Italian school in this region has been at Aphrodisias, where the excavations have thrown new light on the significant school of sculpture associated with this city.<sup>34</sup> A Swedish team excavated the sanctuary of Zeus at Labranda.<sup>35</sup>

*Lycia.* An excavation at Xanthos under Pierre Demargne has resulted in finds from the Lycian period (6th century B. C.) to the Byzantine. Among them are the Roman agora and theater.<sup>36</sup>

*Pamphylia.* An Italian expedition was at work in southern Anatolia before the first World War,<sup>37</sup> and B. Pace resumed excavation at Antalya about 1921. Work continued for several years.<sup>38</sup> Since 1946, Turkish archeologists have excavated at Perge and have made important finds belonging to the first and second centuries A. D. A. M. Mansel has now published a full report.<sup>39</sup> Similar excavations have been undertaken at nearby Side.<sup>40</sup>

*Pisidia and southern Phrygia.* The University of Michigan excavated at Antioch-toward-Pisidia in 1924. Sir William Ramsay, who had once before dug there, was present for part of the time. The temple of Augustus and propylaea were discovered, together with the plazas named for Augustus and Tiberius. The local Roman art was found to have been influenced by that of Pergamum.<sup>41</sup>

<sup>33</sup> Th. Wiegand, *Didyma, 1. Teil, Die Baubeschreibung*, 1. Lief. (Berlin, 1941). Excavations were resumed at Miletus in 1957; cf. Mellink, *AJA*, LXII (1958), 98.

<sup>34</sup> G. Iacopi, "Gli scavi della missione archeologica italiana in Afrosidiade," *Monumenti antichi pubblicati per cura della R. Accademia nazionale dei Lincei*, XXXVIII (1939); *Mostra augustea della Romanità: Catalogo* (Rome, 1940), p. 168, Room XV, No. 13.

<sup>35</sup> Gösta Säflund, "Der Tempel des Donnergottes in Labranda (Kleinasien)," *Atlantis*, XXIV (1932), 37-40; A. W. Persson, *Illustrated London News*, Jan. 15, 1949, pp. 85-87; Persson, *Årsbok Kungl. Vetenskaps Societeten* (Uppsala, 1950), pp. 53-68.

<sup>36</sup> *Fasti Archaeologici*, V (1950), 165 f.; P. Demargne, *Anadolu*, I (1951), 37-40; II (1955), 63-70. Work at Xanthos continued in 1957.

<sup>37</sup> R. Paribeni and P. Romanelli, "Studi e ricerche archeologiche nell' Anatolia meridionale," *Monumenti . . . dei Lincei*, XXIII (1914); Paribeni, "Studi e ricerche . . . secondo rapporto," *Annuario della regia scuola archeologica in Atene*, III (1921), 1 f.

<sup>38</sup> B. Pace, *Annuario*, III (1921), 3-21; G. Moretti, *Annuario*, VI-VII (1926), 435-507; V. Viale, *Annuario*, VIII-IX (1929), 357-92.

<sup>39</sup> A. M. Mansel and Aşkidil Akarca, *Excavations and Researches at Perge* (Ankara, 1949), reviewed in *AJA*, LV (1951), 213 f.; Mansel in *Anadolu*, II (1955), 60-62; Mansel, "Bericht über Ausgrabungen und Untersuchungen in Pamphylien in den Jahren 1946-1955," *Jahrbuch des deutschen Archäologischen Institutes, Archäologischer Anzeiger* (1956), pp. 34-119, figs. 1-69, with basic bibliography.

<sup>40</sup> A. M. Mansel, E. Bosch, J. Inan, *Vorläufiger Bericht über die Ausgrabungen in Side im Jahre 1947* (Ankara, 1951); cf. *AJA*, LVII (1953), 300-302; *Bulleten*, XIV (1950), 683-86; *Fasti Archaeologici*, III (1950), 237; IV (1951), 294 f.; Mansel in *Anadolu*, II (1955), 58-60; A. M. Mansel, G. E. Bean, and J. Inan, *Die Agora von Side und die benachbarten Bauten* (Ankara, 1956).

<sup>41</sup> D. M. Robinson, *AJA*, XXVIII (1924), 435-44; XXX (1926), 125-36; "Roman

*Galatia.* Krenker and Schede excavated the temple of Augustus at Ankara in 1926 and 1928.<sup>42</sup>

*Cilicia.* Professor Hetty Goldman, of Bryn Mawr College, made a preliminary expedition to Cilicia in 1934, and from 1935 to 1939 and again in 1947-49 excavated at Gözlü Kule on the outskirts of Tarsus. This mound includes Hittite, Hellenistic, Roman, and Islamic levels. The Hellenistic and Roman finds, which have been published, illustrate the life of a relatively poor suburb of the city. Much of the Roman city lies far underneath the modern town, but from time to time fragments of it come to light; for example, a fine mosaic was discovered in 1948.<sup>43</sup> More recently, H. Th. Bossert has worked at the seaport of Magarsos near Adana.<sup>44</sup>

*Commagene.* Theresa Goell, who succeeded Miss Goldman as director at Tarsus, has in recent years excavated at Nemrud Dağ in the sanctuary of Antiochus I of Commagene, under the auspices of the American Schools of Oriental Research. Here on the monumental platform of the east court, Antiochus was enthroned with Zeus Oromasdes, Apollo Mithra Helios Hermes, Heracles Artagnas, and the Tyche of Commagene. This further illustrates Antiochus' syncretism.<sup>45</sup> Closely related are the investigations of F. K. Doerner of the University of Münster, who identified the site of Arsameia near the village of Kahta. A large inscription on the Eski Kale revealed the existence of a hierothesion established by Mithridates Kallinikos, father of Antiochus I. Excavations began in 1953.<sup>46</sup>

Excavation is, naturally, only one phase of Anatolian research. One of the most valuable projects in the period between the world wars was the series of explorations sponsored by the American Society for Archaeological Research in Asia Minor, results of which have been published in the series *Monumenta Asiae Minoris Antiqua*.<sup>47</sup> The largest part of the material is inscriptional, but it includes also monuments and surveys of buildings. Several successive expeditions from 1925 on worked in the eastern part of the province of Asia, and in Caria, Galatia, Phrygia, and

Sculptures from Colonia Caesarea (Pisidian Antioch)," *The Art Bulletin*, IX (1926), 5-69.

<sup>42</sup> D. M. Krenker and M. Schede, *Der Tempel in Ankara* (Berlin and Leipzig, 1936); cf. Schede's translation of the *Monumentum Ancyranum, Ankara und Augustus* (Berlin, 1937).

<sup>43</sup> Hetty Goldman (ed.), *Excavations at Gözlü Kule, Tarsus, I: The Hellenistic and Roman Periods* (in two parts; Princeton, 1950).

<sup>44</sup> H. Th. Bossert, *Bulleten*, XIV (1950), 661-66; cf. *AJA*, LV (1951), 90 f.

<sup>45</sup> T. Goell, *Archaeology*, V (1952), 136-44; VI (1953), 246 f.; *BASOR*, No. 147 (Oct., 1957), 4-22.

<sup>46</sup> *Bibliotheca Orientalis*, IX (1952), 93-96; *Anatolian Studies*, IV (1954), 14 f.

<sup>47</sup> *Monumenta Asiae Minoris Antiqua* (7 vols.; Manchester, 1928-56). The eighth volume, promised to appear soon, will conclude the series.



Cilicia Tracheia. Associated with Buckler and Calder in this enterprise were such scholars as Keil, Wilhelm, Guthrie, Herzfeld, and Guyer.

This splendid international project was, in a way, a continuation of Ramsay's work. It includes a rather thorough epigraphical survey of the neighborhood of Denizli for several miles in all directions; then of a region whose line runs roughly northeast from Çal and Çivril to Banaz, east to Afyon, north as far as Eskişehir, back south to the neighborhood of Çifteler, east about as far as the main road from Ankara to Konya, then south to Konya, and thence west as far as Dinar, the ancient Apameia-Celaenae. This region covers the zone in which Phrygian was still spoken in A. D. 250, and a little more territory besides. The importance of this survey for Phrygian, Hellenistic-Roman, and Byzantine studies is obvious. It is also the region through which St. Paul certainly went on some of his journeys.

It would be wrong to give the impression that this is the only important epigraphical work of this period. M. and Mme. Robert have been actively recording inscriptions since 1932, as well as carrying on excavation and numismatic and topographical studies. Apart from one excursion into Tieion in Paphlagonia, and some recording in Pisidia and Phrygia, their activities have centered in the west — Mysia, Lydia, Ionia, Caria, and Lycia.<sup>48</sup> The Italians have explored the region of Konya and in Caria and Pisidia.<sup>49</sup> G. E. Bean in 1948 journeyed along the coast opposite Rhodes, studying topography and inscriptions,<sup>50</sup> and Bosch has published inscriptions from Attaleia.<sup>51</sup> Robert has also published geographical and topographical studies.<sup>52</sup> Explorations have been carried on in various villages west of Lake Tatta, and at Tavium in the old Galatian territory.<sup>53</sup> The French Institute of Archaeology in Istanbul,

<sup>48</sup> *Anadolu*, I (1951), 55–63. Inscriptions from Assos, Cyzicus, the Hellespont and Propontis, Thyatira, Magnesia ad Sipylum, Sardis and other Lydian localities, Tralles, Stratoniceia, Aphrodisias, and Sinuri near Mylasa. See L. Robert, *Le sanctuaire de Sinuri près de Mylasa*, Part I (Paris, 1945); *Bibliographie et Index, 1924–1937* (Limoges, 1938). Cf. also "Inscriptions grecques d'Asie Mineure," in W. M. Calder and J. Keil, *Anatolian Studies presented to William Hepburn Buckler* (Manchester, 1939), pp. 227–48. Among Robert's publications on coins is his *Études de numismatique grecque* (Paris, 1951).

<sup>49</sup> B. Pace, "Ricerche nella regione di Conia, Adalia e Scalanove," *Annuario*, VI–VII (1926), 343–452.

<sup>50</sup> P. M. Fraser and G. E. Bean, *The Rhodian Peraea and Islands* (Oxford, 1954).

<sup>51</sup> E. Bosch, *Belleten*, XI (1947), 87–125.

<sup>52</sup> L. Robert, "Contribution à la topographie des villes de l'Asie Mineure méridionale," *Comptes-rendus des séances, Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres* (1951), 254–59; *Villes d'Asie Mineure: Études de géographie antique* (Paris, 1935).

<sup>53</sup> Walter Ruben, *Ankara Üniversitesi Dil ve Tarih-Coğrafya Fakültesi Dergisi*, V, 4 (1947), 369–89; K. Bittel, "Tavium," *Halil Edhem Hatıra Kitabı* (Ankara, 1947), pp. 171–79. For a list of sites explored by Turkish students, see *Belleten*, VIII (1944), 39–51.

in the years 1935–39 and 1948–50, explored northwest of Afyon and south of Eskişehir.<sup>54</sup>

In recent years Michael R. E. Gough and his associates have done extensive recording at Anavarza (Anazarbus), Bodrum (Hieropolis-Castabala) and Erzin (Epiphaneia?) in the Cilician plain, and at Soli-Pompeiopolis, Seleucia, Elaeusa Sebaste (Ayaş) and Claudiopolis (Mut) in Cilicia Tracheia.<sup>55</sup>

Rather little of the new material on Asia Minor has been utilized by NT scholars, for it is of course difficult to locate, collect, and interpret. A notable exception is *The Beginnings of Christianity*, edited by Jackson and Lake, particularly volumes IV and V which comprise the commentary and additional notes. Lake's criticism of the "south Galatian" theory, for example, has tended to keep minds open on this issue.<sup>56</sup> Sir W. M. Calder's article on "Philadelphia and Montanism" is an important contribution to early church history, and more studies of this sort are needed.<sup>57</sup>

The NT student can of course find much information in the older works of Friedländer and Deissmann,<sup>58</sup> in Rostovtzeff's history,<sup>59</sup> and in the *Festschriften* for Ramsay and Buckler.<sup>60</sup> We now have good monographs on the road systems of Asia Minor.<sup>61</sup> Charlesworth's *Trade Routes and Commerce*,<sup>62</sup> Broughton's large section on Asia Minor in Tenney Frank's *Survey*,<sup>63</sup> Gren's work on Asia Minor and the eastern Balkans,<sup>64</sup> and above all David Magie's magnificent *Roman Rule in Asia*

<sup>54</sup> E. Chaput, *Phrygie: Géologie et géographie physique* (Paris, 1941). Two other volumes in this series deal with the city of Midas. Summary of the work by A. Gabriel, *Anadolu*, I (1951), 31–36.

<sup>55</sup> M. Gough, "Anazarbus," *Anatolian Studies*, II (1952), 85–150. For Mrs. Gough's popular account, see Mary Gough, *Travel into Yesterday* (Garden City, N. Y., 1954).

<sup>56</sup> See, e. g., *The Beginnings of Christianity, Part I, V* (London, 1933), 224–40.

<sup>57</sup> W. M. Calder, "Philadelphia and Montanism," *Bulletin of the John Rylands Library*, VII (1922), 309–54; G. Thieme, *Die Inschriften von Magnesia am Mäander und das N. T.* (Göttingen, 1906).

<sup>58</sup> L. Friedländer, *Darstellungen aus der Sittengeschichte Roms* (Leipzig, 1921); A. Deissmann, *Licht vom Osten* (4th ed.; Tübingen, 1923.)

<sup>59</sup> M. Rostovtzeff, *The Social and Economic History of the Hellenistic World* (Oxford, 1953).

<sup>60</sup> Cf. note 48 above and W. H. Buckler (ed.), *Anatolian Studies presented to Sir William Mitchell Ramsay* (London, 1923).

<sup>61</sup> D. Levi, *Le Grande Strade Romane in Asia* (Rome, 1938); S. Talip, *Le Strade Romane in Anatolia* (Rome, 1938); on the road from Attaleia to Iconium, see B. Pace, *Annuario*, VI–VII (1926), 383–93.

<sup>62</sup> M. P. Charlesworth, *Trade Routes and Commerce of the Roman Empire* (Cambridge, 1924).

<sup>63</sup> T. R. S. Broughton in T. Frank (ed.), *Economic Survey of the Roman Empire*, IV (Baltimore, 1938).

<sup>64</sup> E. Gren, *Kleinasiens und das Ostbalkan in der wirtschaftlichen Entwicklung der römischen Kaiserzeit* (Uppsala, 1941); full bibliography on pp. xii–xxxviii.

*Minor* (2 vols.; Princeton, 1950), provide the NT commentator with a vast amount of information on geography, trade, agriculture, and political and cultural history.<sup>65</sup> Recent years have seen much study of the art, architecture, city planning, and harbor installations of Anatolia in the Hellenistic and Roman periods.<sup>66</sup>

There have been a few special studies of cities and regions. C. J. Cadoux's *Ancient Smyrna* (Oxford, 1938) is an ambitious undertaking of this sort. Turkish scholars have been active in the publication of city histories, guide books and monographs — often in Turkish but usually with translations or summaries in western European languages. The official Turkish road map and the archeological map of western Anatolia are helpful to the beginning student of topography.<sup>67</sup>

### III

In the first century A. D., Asia Minor produced a number of literary figures and intellectuals, some of whom migrated to Rome and other parts of the empire, while many flourished in their homeland. Just before the beginning of our era, Dionysius of Halicarnassus was writing in Rome. At the same time Strabo composed his famous *Geography* — according to some scholars, at Amaseia and primarily for the benefit of the Greeks of Asia Minor. Memnon of Heraclea Pontica wrote a history of the city, part of which has been preserved by Photius. Among the great medical writers of the time were Athenaeus of Attaleia and

<sup>65</sup> The notes and list of abbreviations contain a tremendous amount of bibliographical material.

<sup>66</sup> For example, on art: E. Michon, *Syria*, II (1921), 295–304; G. Iacopi, *Bullettino della commissione archeologica comunale di Roma*, LXVI (1938), Appendice, pp. 39–48; A. L. Pietrogrande, *Bullettino*, LXIII (1935), Appendice, pp. 17–37; on architecture: J. Kohte, *Die Baukunst des klassischen Altertums und ihre Entwicklung in der mittleren und neueren Zeit* (Braunschweig, 1915); W. B. Dinsmoor, *The Architecture of Ancient Greece* (3rd ed.; London, 1950); A. W. Lawrence, *Greek Architecture* (Harmondsworth, 1957), chaps. xix, xxiii; Phyllis Williams Lehmann, "The Setting of Hellenistic Temples," *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, XIII, 4 (Dec., 1954), 15–20; on city planning: Pauly-Wissowa, Fabricius and Lehmann-Hartleben, s. v. "Haus," "Städtebau"; A. von Gerkan, *Griechische Städteanlagen* (Berlin and Leipzig, 1924); Karl Lehmann-Hartleben, *Die antiken Hafenanlagen des Mittelmeeres* (Leipzig, 1923), on Miletus, pp. 147 f.; on Side, pp. 191 f. These references and many others I owe to Professor George M. A. Hanfmann of Harvard.

<sup>67</sup> Afif Erzen, *İlkçağda Ankara*, "Türk Tarih Kurumu yayınlarından," VI. Seri, No. 12 (Ankara, 1946); F. A. Akca, *Pamukkale Suları* (2nd ed.; Denizli, 1946); Osman Bayatlı, *Bergama Tarihinde* (3 fasc.; Istanbul, 1949–51) gives a general view of the history and archeology of Pergamum; cf. O. Deubner, *Das Asklepieion von Pergamon* (Berlin, 1938). Road map: *Türkiye Karayolları Haritası* (1955). Archeological map: Rüstem Duyuran, *Batı Anadolu Arkeoloji Haritası* (Izmir, 1952), contains a list of various publications in Turkish and other languages as well as a gazetteer identifying ancient sites with modern names.

especially the author of *Materia Medica* in five books, Dioscorides of Anazarbus.

Light literature was extremely well represented. In the first century B. C., Parthenius from Nicaea in Bithynia wrote 36 short tales. But the earliest example preserved to us of the hammock reading of that time is Chariton's *Chaereas and Callirhoe*.<sup>68</sup> Chariton came from Aphrodisias in Caria. His novel ought to be discovered by Hollywood, for it contains nothing improper and yet it skilfully glamorizes the Greek girl — in this case, one from Syracuse who, after many adventures, is reunited with her dashing young husband. It is filled with hairbreadth escapes, the emotions of romantic love, recognition scenes, high society life, and world travel — though there are enough scenes laid in Ionia for the people at home to feel the thrill of familiarity. Slavery, pirates, and crucifixion add to the excitement of the story. Poets of first century Asia Minor are represented in the *Greek Anthology*, for example Thallus of Miletus, who deals with military and poetic themes, and hails Tiberius as a god (vi. 235), and Lollius Bassus of Smyrna, who would rather give his Corinna two obols than resort to the tricks of Zeus (v. 125). According to Strabo (xiv. 41) the well-known natives of Magnesia near Maeander include Simus, who introduced improper songs, and Anaxenor the cithara player, who not only got rich because Antony made him a collector of revenue, but was also honored by a painted image in the agora and a bronze statue in the theater.

To return to more serious literature. The treatise *On Style* — not as important as the great work *On the Sublime*, but respectable nevertheless — was written by Demetrius of Tarsus, a friend of Plutarch, who in the year A. D. 80 was teaching Greek as far away as York. Typical orators of the day were Herodes Atticus and Polemon; the latter came from a famous family in Laodicea on the Lycus. These men followed the ornate and flowery Asian style, which according to Strabo was mainly introduced by Hegesias of Magnesia near Maeander. But a reaction toward Atticism was already setting in during the first century. Dio of Prusa, and, later, Aelius Aristides firmly fixed the Atticistic fashion. The two principal Asiatic philosophers of this period were Apollonius of Tyana, known to us almost solely from his biographer Philostratus; and the great Stoic Epictetus, born in Hierapolis, across the Lycus from Laodicea, whose philosophical teaching was carried on in Rome and Nicopolis. Epictetus knew something about Jews and perhaps Christians too; he may first have met them in his home town.

<sup>68</sup> Warren E. Blake, *Chariton's Chaereas and Callirhoe* (Ann Arbor and London, 1939). Blake also edited the Greek text (Oxford, 1938). For a list of first century Greek writers, see E. J. Goodspeed, *JNES*, I (1942), 315-40; cf. also F. A. Wright, *A History of Later Greek Literature* (London, 1932).

Apollonius visited Tarsus early in his career, and one of the remarks of his biographer gives us an unforgettable picture of the men of Tarsus sitting and chattering like idle water birds along the banks of the Cydnus (Philostratus, *Vita Apoll.* i. 7). It is significant that one of his activities was the reformation of local cults. He was intensely curious about foreign religions and philosophies and may have been an important agent for syncretism and the dissemination of new ideas. When Lucian, in the second century, draws his sketch of Alexander of Abonutichus, he remarks that one of Alexander's early teachers and corrupters was an associate of Apollonius. Lucian probably regarded Apollonius as a fraud like Alexander.

Carl Schneider remarks in his recent work that the most popular of all religions in Asia Minor was that of Dionysus, with whom Mithradates and Mark Antony were identified.<sup>69</sup> This appears to be borne out by the large amount of material on the Dionysus cult collected by Martin Nilsson. Even in Phrygia Διούσος meets us in inscriptions.<sup>70</sup> The various local cults continue alongside Dionysus, of course. And the spread of Isis and Sarapis worship is not insignificant. David Magie has recently shown that these cults are first attested in regions which had been under Ptolemaic domination. But from these points they spread freely to other parts of Asia Minor — for example, to Cyme, Adramyttium, Pergamum, and other cities of Aeolis and Mysia. Isis and Sarapis do not appear in Ephesus or Miletus until the Roman imperial period, but in the first century A. D. the headdress of Isis is found on a coin of Laodicea on the Lycus.<sup>71</sup> In the second and third centuries the Egyptian deities spread to Phrygia, Galatia, Pisidia, and Cappadocia, and must have been important competitors of Christianity.

Research into the history of Anatolian art illustrates further the cultural importance of western Asia Minor, particularly the Maeander valley. If Von Gerkan is correct, Hermogenes, the architect of the Dionysus temple in Teos and the temple of Artemis in Magnesia, is nearer to the Christian era than previously thought and should be dated 170–100 B. C. He appears not to have been the inventor of the pseudo-dipteros style, which combined elegance with a reduced construction cost, though Vitruvius gave him this honor; but rather it was he who successfully propagated the style and by his writings greatly influenced the Roman architects.<sup>72</sup> Aphrodisias, just a little south of the Maeander

<sup>69</sup> Carl Schneider, *Geistesgeschichte des antiken Christentums* (Munich, 1954), I, 575 f.

<sup>70</sup> M. P. Nilsson, *Geschichte der griechischen Religion*, II (1950), 341–49. For the Phrygian Diounsis, see Calder, *MAMA*, I, No. 413.

<sup>71</sup> D. Magie, "Egyptian Deities in Asia Minor in Inscriptions and on Coins," *AJA*, LVII (1953), 163–87.

<sup>72</sup> A. von Gerkan, *Der Altar des Artemis-Tempels in Magnesia am Mäander* (Berlin,

and only a few miles from Laodicea, in the first century A. D. had a famous school of sculpture which stood next to that of Athens in artistic creativity and technical skill. In fact, the school of Aphrodisias invented important new techniques, such as the deep drilling of the eyes and hair.<sup>73</sup>

#### IV

When we consider the facts just mentioned, it becomes evident that the region from Ephesus and Miletus up the Maeander to Laodicea was rich and brilliant. It may even have surpassed the valley of the Hermus; at any rate the road along the Maeander was one of the two principal routes between Ephesus and the interior, and it was probably followed by Paul on his third missionary journey.

One cannot help wondering what influence the culture of Asia and Caria had on Jews and early Christians. Sometimes the response must have been negative; in the art some men saw idolatry rather than beauty. John the Apocalypticist regarded Roman imperial power, religion, and commerce only as something that would shortly come to an end, yet some of his visions may take their form from the theater of Ephesus, from whose upper seats one could see the Aegean sea. Jews and Christians could never have constituted a completely separate cultural island.

The Fourth Book of the Sibylline Oracles was obviously written in Asia Minor and can be dated about A. D. 80. The author was probably a Jew, but one who rejected all altars, temples, and animal sacrifice (iv. 27-30), pronounced blessings on those who bless the mighty God before eating and drinking (iv. 24-26) and called on men to repent and wash their bodies in the ever-flowing streams (iv. 162-70). In this connection one may remark that Apollonius of Tyana spoke against animal sacrifice, appealing to the example of Pythagoras (*Vita Apoll.* viii. 12). Lightfoot long ago suggested that the heresy of Colossae was related to Essenism, and based part of his argument on these oracles.<sup>74</sup> Now that so much material from Qumran is available this hypothesis should be re-examined.

The author of these oracles wrote in hexameters and Homeric dialect; that was of course the convention. He was acquainted with several cities of Asia Minor and knew of earthquakes that had befallen them

1929), pp. 27-33. For the earlier view see J. Kohte, *op. cit.*, pp. 10 f., 38 f., 98 f.; cf. also, on the Teos Temple, W. Hahland, *JOAI*, XXXVIII (1950), 66-109; W. B. Dinsmoor, *op. cit.*, pp. 272-75.

<sup>73</sup> Maria Squarciapino, *La Scuola di Afrodizia* (Rome, 1943).

<sup>74</sup> J. B. Lightfoot, *Saint Paul's Epistles to the Colossians and to Philemon* (3rd ed.; London, 1879), pp. 71-111; S. E. Johnson, "Laodicea and Its Neighbors," *Biblical Archaeologist*, XIII, 1 (Feb., 1950), 1-18.

(iv. 107–13, e. g. Laodicea in A. D. 60, Myra, and Patara). His opposition to Rome comes out in the prophecy that the wealth stolen by the Romans from Asia will be restored twofold (iv. 145–47). The recent appearance of a pseudo-Nero in Parthia is one of the signs of the end (iv. 138–39), and “the cities of the Carians by the Maeander” are singled out for a special doom — they will suffer famine when the river buries its black waters. The Sibylline writer teaches that the world will end in fire and that afterward God will raise human beings up for the final judgment (iv. 173–84). Thus he seems to combine Jewish eschatology with popular philosophy.

The beginnings of Christianity in Anatolia are bound up closely with the numerous and wealthy Jewish communities. We do not know the origin of the Jewish colony in Tarsus. Inscriptions show that Jews lived not only in the Cilician plain but as far west as Seleucia on the Calycadnus.<sup>75</sup> We are told that Antiochus III ordered Zeuxis to settle 2,000 Mesopotamian Jewish families in Lydia and Phrygia (Josephus *Ant.* xii. 3. 4), and this may be the origin of the Jewish settlement of those regions. Josephus tells of exemptions and privileges granted Jews who were Roman citizens (*Ant.* xiv. 10. 12, 22) and Cicero reveals the fact that much gold was exported to Jerusalem (*Pro Flacco* 67; *In Vat.* 12). Herod the Great made generous gifts to various cities of Ionia.<sup>76</sup>

Late Jewish and Christian writings claim that the mountain behind Apameia was the place where the ark rested (e. g. *Or. Sib.* i. 261–62). This is interesting because the inscriptional evidence also shows that the Jewish colony there was very numerous, as it was in Hierapolis and Laodicea. Apameia produced grapes used to make a honey-wine,<sup>77</sup> and Ignatius in writing to the Trallians compares the mixture of Christianity and other beliefs to mixing a deadly poison with honeyed wine (Trall. 6 2). Gentile Christians like Ignatius were disturbed by the Judaizing problem (e. g. *Magn.* 8 1, 9 1, 10 3; *Philad.* 6 1, 8 2). As late as the fourth century the Council of Laodicea legislated against Sabbath observance. In the Book of Revelation there is already hostility against the Jewish synagogues.

On and near the Aegean coast there were numerous Jews, e. g. at Smyrna, Ephesus, Sardis, Philadelphia, Pergamum, Miletus, Halicarnassus, and Priene (where there is a fine early synagogue).<sup>78</sup> Inscriptional material from Phrygia gives evidence of Jews in and near Akmonia, Apollonia, and Synnada, as well as Apameia, i. e. south and west of

<sup>75</sup> J. Keil and A. Wilhelm, *MAMA*, III, Nos. 23, 32, 205, 222, 237, 262, 295, 344, 440, 448, 607, 679.

<sup>76</sup> On Herod's gifts, see D. Magie, *Roman Rule*, I, 479.

<sup>77</sup> *Ibid.*, I, 50.

<sup>78</sup> E. L. Sukenik, *Ancient Synagogues in Palestine and Greece* (London, 1934), pp. 42 f.

Afyon. But the Debbora who lived at Apollonia did not come from Antioch-toward-Pisidia but probably Antioch on the Maeander.<sup>79</sup> Acts, of course, speaks of Jews at Pisidian Antioch (13 14), Iconium (14 1), Lystra and Derbe (16 3). Jews lived not only in Pontus but on the north side of the Black Sea.<sup>80</sup> But there is, so far as I know, no inscriptional evidence for Jews in Burnt Laodicea, in the villages of the treeless region west of the Salt Lake, nor in Orcistus, Nacoleia, and Dorylaeum (Eskişehir) in northwest Phrygia.

Now of course Paul worked mainly in cities where there were some Jews. But Broughton perhaps goes too far when he remarks, "It is significant that he did not turn to north Phrygia, north Galatia, or Cappadocia."<sup>81</sup> The case of Cappadocia may be granted. There is no positive evidence that he *worked* in the other two regions but he surely came that way. If Acts is correct, the Holy Spirit inhibited him and his companions from preaching in Asia on the second journey (16 6). If this is to be taken strictly, and if the boundary between the provinces of Asia and Galatia ran east of Philomelium and Antioch, the apostle would have gone almost due north from Iconium. Then, when he was opposite Mysia, that is at least as far north as a line from Nacoleia (Seyitgazi) to Kotieion (Kütahya), the Spirit again inhibited him, this time from going into Bithynia, so he turned west and went through Mysia to Troas. A glance at the river valleys, highways, and railroads on the modern map shows that the easiest way would seem to be by Dorylaeum, Kotieion, and Hadrianouterai (Balıkesir) to the neighborhood of Adramyttium.

He would thus have been at least on the edge of genuine Galatian territory and not far from Gordium and Pessinus (Balıhisar). There is no need to assume in any case that he would have gone as far east as Ancyra and Tavium. Now what do we know about these Gauls of Galatia at the time of Paul? Ancyra itself was enough Romanized to have a great temple of Augustus, with an inscription of his *res gestae*. We have an inscription of the Galatian league, also, dating from the early first century. It appears that the Gauls were organized by tribes and led by aristocratic families. Already in the first century B. C. the nobility had been at least superficially Hellenized and had begun to adopt Greek names. The official language was Greek, and Celtic names die out entirely in the second century A. D.<sup>82</sup> Although the peasantry

<sup>79</sup> For inscriptions regarding Jews, see, e. g., *MAMA*, IV, No. 90; VI, Nos. 264, 277, 316, 325, 335, 335a. On Debbora, see Calder in *MAMA*, VII, x.

<sup>80</sup> C. Schneider, *op. cit.*, I, 578.

<sup>81</sup> Broughton, *op. cit.*, p. 867.

<sup>82</sup> A. H. M. Jones, *The Cities of the Eastern Roman Provinces* (Oxford, 1937), pp. 120-22. Cf. Mansel, *Anadolu*, I (1951), 41-53, for report of a tumulus of a Galatian princely family, about 50 B. C. The Augusteum at Ankara, which is a pseudo-dipteral



still spoke Celtic, as we know from Lucian's story of Alexander the Oracle Monger and from Jerome, there were townspeople to whom Paul could speak in Greek. There is therefore the likelihood that he was in their territory and it is not impossible that he founded churches among them. Positive evidence is, of course, wanting.

Enough has been said in this address to indicate the rich possibilities which a thorough study of the Anatolian background might open up for a student of the NT. Nearly every part of Asia Minor which has a bearing on the history of primitive Christianity has had, at least, surface exploration, and many of the sites have been partially excavated. It is good news that work will be resumed at Sardis next summer under the sponsorship of the American Schools of Oriental Research, with support from the Bollingen Foundation, Harvard University, and Cornell University. But what might we learn from further exploration or excavation of Adramyttium, Alexandria Troas, Myra, Patara, Philadelphia, Tralles, Apameia in Phrygia, and Philomelium? Colossae has not been excavated, Lystra is almost untouched, and the site of Derbe has never been certainly identified.

Asia Minor continues to pose some completely unsolved questions. Chief of these is the variety of Christianity in this region. In the late first century, parts of it were still in close touch with Judaism and the Jewish Christianity of Palestine. We know that the author of the Book of Revelation still approved of the Church of Ephesus, which had rejected false apostles and Nicolaitans; he also had good words to say about the churches in Smyrna and Philadelphia. Colossae and the Maeander valley were under Jewish influence, otherwise Paul and Ignatius would not have written the letters dealing with this. Papias of Hierapolis, in the early second century, still depended strongly on oral tradition from Palestine.

On the other hand, the churches of Pergamum, Thyatira, and Sardis suffer criticism from the prophet John. Ignatius, whose Christianity is extremely Hellenistic, counts most of the Asiatic bishops as his friends and supporters, yet the Judaizing problem is still acute. Nevertheless, by A. D. 115 the situation has greatly changed and it is not long before Marcionism and Montanism are very strong in Anatolia. How does it come about that it is in this region that we first see the monarchical episcopate combined with a council of presbyters? Did this polity arise out of the religious conflict, and are there any parallels to it in non-Christian cults?

Where does the Gospel of John come into this picture? Is it indeed Ephesian? Many scholars have suggested that the miracle of Cana fits

temple, probably antedates Augustus, and this is another indication of the spread of Hellenism in this region; cf. Dinsmoor, *op. cit.*, p. 276.

appropriately into the book if it was written in a region where the Dionysus cult is prominent. The symbolism of water, so frequent in this gospel, makes us think of the Fourth Sibylline Oracle and the disciples of John the Baptist. On the other hand, these characteristics may be Palestinian. If so, the gospel came to Asia Minor in the second century and influenced Christianity there. The religion of the gospel is very different from that of the Book of Revelation, yet its doctrine of the Spirit, together with that of Revelation and the prophetic traits of Ignatius and Philip's four daughters, may have helped to pave the way for Montanism.

There are currents and cross-currents in the Christianity of Asia Minor. At any moment some discovery, whose nature we cannot imagine, may help us to understand them a little better.